

# COMMONWEALTH OF PUERTO RICO

Department of Health Puerto Rico Medicaid Program

### AWARD NOTIFICATION TALENT RESOURCING 2023-PRMP-TR-002

Pursuant to Executive Order Num.  $2021-029^1$ , Administrative Order Num. OA- $535^2$ , Act. No.  $38/2017^3$ , as amended, and 45 CFR 74.327-329, the Puerto Rico Medicaid Program (PRMP) issued a Request for Proposal with the purpose of selecting a vendor who could provide temporary staffing needs and payroll services to the program.

In response to the request, PRMP received proposals from four (4) vendors: ManpowerGroup, Inc., (Manpower), Caribbean Temporary Services, LLC, (CTS), Capitol Bridge, LLC (Capitol Bridge), and Management Temporary & Contract Employment Services, Inc., (MSSS). In accordance with section 5.1 of the RFP, proposals were evaluated in two parts by a committee of five individuals. The first evaluation attended the technical proposal and the second, the cost proposal. Proposals were to be evaluated across four Global Criterions: Vendor Qualifications and Experience, Vendor Organization and Staffing, Approach to SOW and Outcomes, and Cost Proposal, using a weight/score formula.

Based on the committee's determinations and scores given to the proposals, the Evaluation Committee recommended to the PRMP Executive Director that the Buena Pro and subsequent contract be awarded to Manpower, whose proposal scored a total of 770 out of a possible 950 points. Having agreed with and accepted the committee's recommendation, the Executive Director notifies this Award Notification in favor of ManpowerGroup, Inc.

Prior to the formation of the contract, Manpower must submit all appropriate documentation to the PRMP contract. Furthermore, it is notified that no service should be provided by Manpower until a copy of the contract is filed with the Puerto Rico Office of the Comptroller.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Issued by the Governor of the Commonwealth of Puerto Rico.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Issued by the Department of Health of Puerto Rico.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Known as the Uniform Administrative Procedures Act of the Government of Puerto Rico.

Award Notification 2023-PRMP-TR-002 Page 2 of 11

### PROCEDURAL BACKGROUND

On June 16, 2023, the PRMP published through the program and the Department of Health's websites a request for proposal with the purpose of selecting a vendor who could provide temporary staffing needs and payroll services to the program. Interested vendors presented a total of 63 questions which answers were uploaded to the websites. Four vendors presented proposals.

Originally, the evaluation process was scheduled to begin around July – August 2023, but due to the Medicaid unwinding planning process and activities, dates were moved forward to October – November 2023. The Secretary of Health's appointed Evaluation Committee commenced the analysis of the proposals accordingly, nevertheless, due to the unavailability of one of its members to continue, the process was once again postponed. Notice was uploaded to the websites letting participating vendors know of the delay.

On January 26, 2024, the Evaluation Committee resumed its analysis. Members of the committee evaluated each technical proposal at an individual level, followed by a group session where they discussed individual's scores and reached a group score consensus. This process repeated itself for each proposal. Up to this point, cost proposals remained sealed. Once all technical proposals were scored, the cost proposals were evaluated, and their scores added to the technical scores to determine the final value of each proposal.

Oral presentations were not held.

PROPOSAL SUMMARY

**ManpowerGroup, Inc.**, has been operating in Puerto Rico since 1958, with three offices across the island (San Juan, Manatí and Hormigueros). It is a publicly traded global company with "a presence in most countries of the world". Among its local clients are several government agencies, working for over ten years.

According to its proposal, Manpower uses several strategies to attract candidates, from targeted, local recruiting techniques to technology-enhanced recruiting. Additionally, maintains available candidates in a proprietary database.

To handle Medicaid's needs, the vendor proposes the following management structure:

- Program Management Oversees all day-to-day program operations from recruiting strategy and order management to associate engagement and quality management delivered to client.
- Account Management Aligns strategies with client's business goals. Oversees all account strategy and relationship management.

Award Notification 2023-PRMP-TR-002 Page 3 of 11

> Service, Recruitment and Operations – Focuses on sourcing, assessing, matching, and placing candidates.

Manpower percent of mark-up is 41%.

**Caribbean Temporary Services, LLC**, is a local company established in 1983 with four branches located in San Juan, Las Piedras, Barceloneta, and San Germán. Among its clients are Medtronics, Lilly del Caribe, Bacardí Corporation, PTCC/Claro, Coliseo de Puerto Rico, PepsiCo Caribbean, and a few government agencies.

According to its proposal, CTS recruitment process includes but is not limited to CTS' web page, where candidates can start by filling out the employment application. Also, through social media, job platforms, personal referrals, walkins, and email requests (referred). College and job fairs, trade activities, ads on radio and newspapers. Labor Department lists, and vocational/technical schools, among other sources.

To handle Medicaid's needs, the vendor proposes the following management structure at a branch level:

- Human Resources Analyst Identifies resources through interviews and evaluations of job candidates to nourish the Human Resources pool of talent.
- Human Resources Officer Responsible for identifying, referring, and hiring temporary employees. Serves as primary contact regarding recruitment and personnel management.
- Human Resources Coordinator Specialized work in customer service of the account in charge. Simplify and streamline direct communication with clients and employees through regular weekly visits, calls, and emails, among other functions.
- Payroll Officers Will process the payroll of all temporary employees in the department.

CTS percent of mark-up is 44%.

**Capitol Bridge, LLC**, is a talent resourcing organization with more than seven years supporting State Medicaid programs, as well as the Federal Medicare program through a variety of contracts with the Centers of Medicare and Medicaid. Local services would be provided by its subsidiary Capitol Bridge Puerto Rico, LLC with offices in Isabela.

According to its proposal, to attract qualified and interested candidates, the vendor utilizes platforms such as Indeed, Zip recruiter, Linkedin, Facebook, Online Classifieds and Talent. Com. Also maintains relationships with the career Award Notification 2023-PRMP-TR-002 Page 4 of 11

development departments of the University of Puerto Rico and InterAmerican-University of Puerto Rico.

To handle Medicaid's needs, the vendor proposes the following management structure:

- Country Manager Will serve as the single point of contact to coordinate and assist in any employment requests, availability, scheduling, billing, contract compliance requirements, reports and problem solving. Will be supported by the Client Account Director and Deputy Program Manager.
- ➢ 2 Human Resources Managers:
  - Talent Recruiter Responsible for ascertaining recruitment requirements by evaluating organizational and position needs.
  - Talent Acquisition Responsible for recruiting performance; candidate evaluation process; employee compensation, etc.
- Resource Officer Responsible for managing and maintaining all recruiting metrics accurately, maintaining pristine records and preparing reports.
- > Payroll Officer Responsible for managing payroll.

Capitol Bridge percent of mark-up is 70%.

Management Temporary & Contract Employment Services, Inc., is a local staffing services company founded in 1982. It provides professional services to PRTC/Claro, Crowley, and Amgen, as well as to a few government agencies. Main offices are in San Juan (Hato Rey) with a branch office in Aguadilla.

According to its proposal, to attract qualified and interested candidates, MSSS uses company website and social media; online Job Boards including Indeed, Linkedin and Clasificados PR; Employee/client referrals; colleges and academic institutions; and Puerto Rico Department of Labor and Municipal Consortiums.

To handle Medicaid's needs, the vendor proposes the following management structure:

- Client Account Director Overview the project and operational strategies for the recruitment process.
- Resource (branch manager) Manager of project and second recruiting and back up personnel.
- > Talent Acquisition Screening process and interview, job fairs.
- Talent Recruiting Screening process and interview, responsible for the onboarding documents and administration of personnel record.
- > Payroll Officer Responsible for the payroll process.
- Accounts/receivable Officer Responsible for the invoice process.

MSSS percent of mark-up is 43%.

Award Notification 2023-PRMP-TR-002 Page 5 of 11

# PROPOSAL EVALUATION – METHOD AND ANALYSIS

Section 3.11.4 of the RFP instructed vendors to submit proposals in two distinct parts sealed in separate envelopes: technical proposal and cost proposal. As stated above, prior to the opening of the cost proposals, technical proposals were evaluated by each member of the committee at an individual level, followed by group sessions where members discussed their personal analysis and reached a consensus. Members were to assign a value from a scale of 1 through 5 to each criterion according to the following rubric:

- 5: Excellent exceeds the requirements
- 4: Good fully addresses the requirements
- 3: Acceptable addresses the requirements, but has some minor deficiencies
- 2: Marginal Partially addresses the requirements or is very limited
- 1: Unacceptable Fails to address the requirements

The following evaluation criteria was stated in the RFP:

#### Table 1

Scoring Area	Points Allocated
Criterion 1: Vendor Qualifications and Experience	100 Points Possible
Criterion 2: Vendor Organization and Staffing	100 Points Possible
Criterion 3: Approach to SOW and Outcomes	450 Points Possible
Criterion 4: Initial Project Schedule	100 Points Possible
Criterion 5: Cost Proposal	300 Points Possible
Criterion 5: Oral Presentations	50 Points Possible
Total Points Possible	1,150 Points

Criteria 4 and 6 were discarded by the Evaluation Committee. Criteria 4: Initial Project Schedule was included in the RFP by an unforeseen error<sup>4</sup>, and oral presentations allowed by Criteria 6: Oral Presentations were deemed unnecessary<sup>5</sup>.

The final evaluation criteria used by the evaluation Committee was as follows:

#### Table 2

Scoring Area	Points Allocated
Criterion 1: Vendor Qualifications and Experience	100 Points Possible
Criterion 2: Vendor Organization and Staffing	100 Points Possible

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Even though Criterion 4 was included in *Table 3* of the RFP, no information regarding this item was solicited.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Section 5.2 of the RFP referenced this item as optional.

Award Notification 2023-PRMP-TR-002 Page 6 of 11

#### Cont Table 2

Scoring Area	Points Allowed
Criterion 3: Approach to SOW and Outcomes	450 Points Possible
Criterion 4: Cost Proposal	300 Points Possible
Total Points Possible	950 points

To come up with the points allocated in the RFP, a weight/score formula was implemented. With regards to each technical criterion, throughout the RFP vendors were solicited specific information. Technical proposals were evaluated based on their submitted responses. Each item had an assigned weight, which had to be multiplied by the consensus score given by the committee to get the final points. The following table displays solicited items and their assigned weights:

Scoring Area			
Vendor Qualifications/Experience			
(a) Overview and existing business relationships in PR	5		
(b)Business disputes			
(c)References	5		
(d)Describe what sets company apart and qualified to handle Medicaid program	5		
Vendor Organization/Staffing			
(e) Initial staffing plan	10		
(f) Key staff, resumes, references			
Approach to SOW and Outcomes			
(g)Recruitment process	15		
(h)Benefits			
(i) Payrolls			
(j) Administrative	15		
(k)Transition	10		
(1) Company's successful rates	10		
(m) Business	5		
(n)Collaboration			

Table 3

The weights assigned to each *technical* criterion multiplied by a score of 5 would give 650, the maximum available points for technical proposals. The following table portraits the Evaluation Committee consensus scores for each vendor's *technical* proposal and their respected allotted points<sup>6</sup>:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Captions used to describe *scoring area* as identified in Table 3.

Award Notification 2023-PRMP-TR-002 Page 7 of 11

Area Weight	Man	power CTS		Capitol Bridge		MSSS			
Alta		Score	Points	Score	Points	Score	Points	Score	Points
Vendor	Vendor Q/Eex		100 max		100 max		100 max		100 max
а	5	4	20	3	15	2	10	4	20
b	5	4	20	3	15	3	15	1	5
с	5	4	20	4	20	3	15	4	20
d	5	3	15	4	20	4	20	3	15
	subtotal		75		70		60		60
Vendor	Org/Stf		100 max		100 max	Sec.	100 max		100 max
e	10	3	30	4	40	3	30	3	30
f	10	4	40	4	40	3	30	4	40
subtotal		70		80		60		70	
Approa	ch SOW		450 max		450 max		450 max		450 max
g	15	4	60	4	60	4	60	4	60
h	15	4	60	4	60	4	60	3	45
i	15	4	60	3	45	3	45	3	45
j	15	3	45	3	45	4	60	3	45
k	10	3	30	4	40	3	30	2	20
1	10	4	40	3	30	4	40	3	30
m	5	4	20	3	15	4	20	3	15
n	5	2	10	4	20	4	20	2	10
	S	ubtotal	325		315		335		270
		Total	470		465		455		400

Table 4

After the technical evaluation exercise ended, the committee proceeded to open and add the cost proposal criteria to the equation. The highest possible points, 300, were automatically given to the proposal with the lowest markup cost. Points provided to the other cost proposals were assigned using the following formula:

lowest vendor's<br/>markup300the vendor's markup<br/>being scoredx(the maximum number of<br/>cost points available)=cost proposal<br/>points assigned

According to the vendors cost proposals, points were assigned as follows:

Manpower: (41%/41%) x 300 = 300 CTS:

 $(41\%/44\%) \ge 300 = 280$ 

Capitol Bridge (41%/70%) x 300 = 176 Award Notification 2023-PRMP-TR-002 Page 8 of 11

# MSSS (41%/ 43%) x 300 = 286

The following table portraits the final overall points given to each proposal:

Proposal	Manpower	CTS	Capitol Bridge	MSSS
	Points	Points	Points	Points
Technical	470	465	455	400
Cost	300	280	176	286
Total	770	745	631	686

#### Table 5

As shown in table 5, Manpower ended up with the overall highest points score, having ranked first in both, technical and cost proposals. Even though CTS and Capitol Bridge ended up with competitive technical scores, Manpower's cost proposal (mark-up margin) provided the definitive advantage over its closest competitor, MTS. Having ample experience providing staffing services to several agencies of the government of Puerto Rico (Department of Health included) the Evaluation Committee felt confident to recommend the award to be given to Manpower.

CTS presented a competitive proposal, ranking first in the Vendor Organization and Staffing – Global Criterion. With four branches across the island, members of the committee felt that PRMP's needs could be well addressed. But CTS was the only vendor who presented several exceptions to the terms and conditions of the RFP. Although the vendor explained the reasons and provided some acceptable alternative languages, members of the committee expressed concerns with the number of exceptions (thirty in total – some minor). Another downside for CTS was that it ranked third in the cost proposal.

Capitol Bridge ranked first in the Approach to Scope of Work – Global Criterion. Members of the committee were impressed with the vendor's experience with Medicare/Medicaid, and CMS staffing experience, as well as the package of benefits provided to employees. Also, members enjoyed the vendor's enthusiastic approach to tackling PRMP's needs, although were somewhat skeptical about their ability to provide expedited services from their offices in Isabela. Nevertheless, its 70% markup proved to be detrimental, forcing the vendor not just to rank last place in overall points, but outside of serious consideration.

Although MSSS ranked third in overall points (due to its markup margin) its technical proposal was the least favored by the committee. Members did not connect with the vendor's proposal, finding the responses to be vague or too general. Some members thought that the proposal lacked enthusiasm and were even distraught about its few grammatical errors. Award Notification 2023-PRMP-TR-002 Page 9 of 11

### PRMP DETERMINATION

Hereby it is notified that the Puerto Rico Medicaid Program accepts the Evaluation Committee's recommendation to award the Buena Pro and subsequent contract to ManpowerGroup, Inc. In this case, Manpower's proposal not only ended up with the highest overall score in the technical proposal evaluation, but also presented the most advantageous cost proposal for PRMP.

As mentioned before, the contract must be filed with the Puerto Rico Office of the Comptroller before any services can be provided.

In accordance with section 3.19 of the Puerto Rico Administrative Procedures Act<sup>7</sup>, a copy of this Award Notification will be sent by certified **EMAIL** to all vendors to the addresses provided.

On March 15, 2024 in San Juan, Puerto Rico.

Dinorah Collazo-Ortiz, ESQ Executive Director Puerto Rico Medicaid Program

<sup>7</sup> 3 LPRA §9659.

## ADMINISTRATIVE REVISION/JUDICIAL REVIEW – TERMS

Any person or party adversely affected or aggrieved by this award may, according to 3 LPRA §9659, file a motion for reconsideration with the Puerto Rico Department of Health (PRDoH) within a term of **ten (10) days** from the date of the notification of the award. The PRDoH must consider the motion for reconsideration within **ten (10) business days** of being filed. If any determination is made in its consideration, the term to request the appeal for judicial review will begin from the date on which a copy of the notification of the decision of the PRDoH is filed on record, according to the case, resolving the motion for consideration. If the filing date of the copy of the notification of the decision is different from that of the deposit in the ordinary mail or the sending by electronic means of said notification, the term will be calculated from the date of the deposit in the ordinary mail or sending by electronic means, as appropriate. If the PRDoH fails to take any action in relation to the motion for reconsideration within **ten** (10) days of its filing, it shall be understood that the motion was denied outright, and the time to request judicial review shall start to run from said date.

If the PRDoH Accepts the reconsideration request within the term provided, it must issue the reconsideration decision or resolution within thirty (30) days following the filing of the motion for reconsideration. If the PRDoH accepts the motion for reconsideration but fails to take any action in relation to the motion within thirty (30) days of its filing, it will lose its jurisdiction and the term to request the judicial review will begin from the expiration of said term of thirty (30) days. The PRDoH may extend said term only once, for an additional period of fifteen (15) days.

Any person or party adversely affected by a final reconsideration or decision may file a petition for review with the Puerto Rico Court of Appeals within a term of **twenty (20) business days** of such final decision or determination being filed.<sup>8</sup>

The mere presentation of a motion for reconsideration does not have the effect of preventing the PRMP from continuing with the procurement process within this request for Proposal.

<sup>8</sup> See 3 LPRA § 9672.

Award Notification 2023-PRMP-TR-002 Page 11 of 11

# CERTIFICATION

I hereby certify that on March 15, 2024, copy of this award Notification has been sent via certified mail to all vendors to the addresses provided for legal notices in the submitted proposals:

Vialys Rivera-Ruiz	Christopher Shiplett, Esq.
Client Account Director	General Counsel
Melissa Rivera Roena	Kara Volk
Market VP	Capitol Bridge, LLC
ManpowerGroup, Inc.	671 North Glebe Road Suite 1600
650 Ave. Muñoz Rivera Suite 102	Arlington, VA 22203
San Juan, PR 00918	christopher.shiplett@capitolbridge.com
vialys.rivera-ruiz@manpower.com	kara.volk@capitolbridge.com
melissa.rivera@manpower.com	
Bárbara González	Mónica Quiñones
Account Executive	SVP Operations
Glenda Burgos	Ivonna Pacheco, PhD.
General Manager	SVP
Caribbean Temporary Services, LLC	Management Temporary & Contract
1431 Ponce de León ave Suite 701	Employment Services, Inc.
San Juan, PR 00909	PO Box 192392
<u>barbara.gonzalez@ctspr.com</u>	San Juan, PR 00919-2392
glenda.burgos@ctspr.com	mquinones@msssinc.com
	ipacheco@msssinc.com

Elizabeth Otero Martínez Solicitation Coordinator elizabeth.otero@salud.pr.gov